

Town of Catskill Planning Board

Planning Board Meeting

May 25, 2021 6:30 PM

Robert C Antonelli Senior Center

Present: Chairwoman-Teresa Golden, Vice Chairman- Larry Federman (Virtually- Zoom Media), Brenda VanDermark , Angelo DiCaprio, Bridgett Hernandez, William DeLuca, Heather Bagshaw, Secretary Patricia Case-Keel.

Attendace: All Present

Also Present: Ted Hilscher (Town Attorney), Kevin Schwenzfeier (Delaware Engineering) .

Chairwoman Teresa Golden opened the meeting with the Pledge of Allegiance to the flag.

Ms. Golden gave few opening remarks for tonight's meeting. Due to the Covid-19 pandemic, and the despite the fact everyone is maintaining 6' distancing at this meeting , it is strongly encouraged for any one, not vaccinated to continue to wear masks, and If anyone is unwilling or unable to wear a face mask, she would recommend that they participate in the meetings virtually through the Zoom platform.

The next Planning Board meetings will be June 8, 2021, and June 22, 2021. The Greene County Planning Boards next meeting will be June 16, 2021 and July 21, 2021. Any application requiring a 239 Review must submit all of the required materials 12 days prior.

At tonight's meeting the Board will holding be 2 public hearings. The Planning Board respectfully asks anyone participating to state their name and address, and limit their remark's to 3 minutes if possible . Participants should address the entire Planning Board and not to any specific member. Speakers should present their remarks in a courteous manner; observe the commonly accepted rules of decorum, dignity, and good taste. Speakers who disregard these rules, disturb the peace at a meeting, make impertinent or slanderous remarks, or generally conduct themselves in an inappropriate manner, shall be barred from further participation and will forfeit any balance of time remaining for their comments. .

OPEINING OF PUBLIC HEARING 6:35 PM

Special Use Permit SUP-4-2021 Dalina Gjergji 4 Forest Hill Road, Leeds.

This application was first before the Board on March 9, 2021 for a sketch conference. The applicant returned to the Board on March 23, 2021 and was classified as an unlisted action and uncoordinated review and the Town of Catskill Planning Board as lead agency .An update drawing was accepted on April 18, 2021 as a preliminary plat ,and a Public Hearing was as scheduled for tonight's meeting .

Mr. Gjergji gave a brief overview for this request to change a single family dwelling into a two family dwelling.

Ms. Golden opened the Public Hearing for Special Use Permit SUP-4-2021 Dalina Gjergji 4 Forest Hill Ave, Leeds. The Notice of Public Hearing was published in the Daily Mail on May 19 2020 and May 20, 2021.

NOTICE OF PUBLIC HEARING

The Town of Catskill Planning Board will hold a Public Hearing on May 25, 2021 at 6:35 PM at the Robert C. Antonelli Senior Center located at 15 Academy Street, in the Village of Catskill, New York. The purpose of the public hearing is to allow the public to make comment on an application by Dalina Gjergji for the conversion of a single family dwelling to a two family dwelling located at 4 Forest Hill Road, Catskill NY Tax Map #138.15-1-11.2 pursuant to Section 160-12 of the Town of

Catskill Zoning Code. The Public is also welcomed to attend through the digital Zoom.com platform. Detailed information for the Zoom platform will be posted with the Planning Board's Meeting Agenda on the Town website. Written and oral comments will be accepted until the close of the public hearing. The above application is open for inspection at the Planning Board Office located at 439 Main Street, Catskill, New York between the hours of 10:00 a.m. and 2:00 p.m. (Due to the COVID- 19 Pandemic Please call and make appointment for inspection of application) By order of Teresa Golden Chairman, Planning Board, Town of Catskill.

The applicant submitted the green cards for the certified mail .

Ms. Golden asked three times if there were any questions or comments regarding SUP-4-2021.

There were no questions or comments

Mr. DeLuca made a motion to close the Public Hearing for SUP-4-2021, seconded by Ms. Bagshaw

Roll Call Vote

Mr. DeLuca	Aye
Mr. DiCaprio	Aye
Ms. VanDermark	Aye
Mr. Federman	Aye
,Ms. Hernandez	Aye
Ms. Golden	Aye
Ms. Bagshaw	Aye Motion Approved

PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED AT 6:50PM

OPENING OF PUBLIC HEARING 6:55 PM

Special Use Permit SUP-2-2021 Apple Realty Holdings (The Ranch) 5389 Rt. 32, Catskill.

This application was first before the Board on January 26, 2021 for the proposed use of an outdoor recreational facility. At that that time the Board classified the application as an unlisted uncoordinated review and declared lead agency. The application returned to the Board on April 27,2021 with revised plans and the Board accepted the plans as preliminary, and a public hearing was scheduled for tonight's meeting. The applicant submitted revised plans on May 14, 2021, and Delaware Engineer had reviewed the plans and submitted their assessment on May 18, 2021.

Ms. Golden opened the Public Hearing for Special Use Permit SUP-2-2021 Apple Realty (The Ranch) 5389 Rt. 32 Catskill. The Notice of Public Hearing was published in the Daily Mail on May 19 2020 and May 20, 2021.

NOTICE OF PUBLIC HEARING

The Town of Catskill Planning Board will hold a Public Hearing on May 25, 2021 at 6:50 PM at the Robert C. Antonelli Senior Center located at 15 Academy Street, in the Village of Catskill, New York. The purpose of the public hearing is to allow the public to make comment on an a proposed site plan by The Ranch (Apple Realty Holdings Corp) for construction of outdoor recreational facility located at 5389 Rt. 32 , Catskill NY Tax Map #136.00-8-46.1 pursuant to Section160-14 of the Town of Catskill Zoning Code. The Public is also welcomed to attend through the digital Zoom.com platform. Detailed information for the Zoom platform will be posted with the Planning Board's Meeting Agenda on the Town website. Written and oral comments will

be accepted until the close of the public hearing. The above application is open for inspection at the Planning Board Office located at 439 Main Street, Catskill, New York between the hours of 10:00 a.m. and 2:00 p.m. (Due to the COVID- 19 Pandemic Please call and make appointment for inspection of application) By order of Teresa Golden Chairman, Planning Board, Town of Catskill.

Scott Quimet is an engineer from Kaaterskill Associates and is representing the applicant at tonight's meeting. Mr. Quimet gave an overview of the proposed project .The applicant is requesting a Special Use Permit for the development of a recreational facility with go carts and a track 25' wide and 600' long , batting cages, miniature golf, and a concession stand with an outdoor seating area . The site will have a new private well and septic system. Changes to the plans were made to address concerns regarding the well location and septic , and the cutting of trees for the development of the septic and with the SWPP. A copy of the sewer easement will be submitted in response to a condition of approval.

The Board reviewed the memo submitted by Delaware Engineering dated May 18, 2021 .

Ms. Golden asked if there were any questions or comments from the public.

Guy Matison resides at 5390 Rt. 32. Mr. Madison stated his property is directly across the street from the site and he also has additional property on the other side this site along with two other parcels in the vicinity. He wants to know what kind of impact there will be from noise generated by the go carts and what the surface of the track will be and if there will be dust created, and also if the go carts will be 2 stroke or 4 stroke. He has concerns regarding disturbance to his well from potential fracking, septic run off and storm water runoff, and the increase in traffic. He also would like to know what the hours of operation will be.

A resident stated when Carson city was in operation they use to hear a lot of the loud noises coming form the site .She has a house and shop about 900 yards from the proposed site and has serious concerns regarding the potential for noise and the increase in traffic. She asked if there will be any amplified music and what the hours of operation will be. There is also a concern regarding garbage attracting wildlife.

Chrystal Dovigh was attending the meeting via Zoom media. She resides at 5467 Rt. 32. Ms. Dovigh stated she agrees with the other residents regarding potential for noise, especially coming from the go carts, and amplified sounds.

Mr. Quimet responded to the questions and concerns raised by residents. Mr. Quimet stated the go carts will be 4 stroke and will have governor's on them. The track is over 700' from any residents. The hours of operation will be within the T.O.C noise ordinance .The noise level should be within the ambient level ,since the site is right on Rt. 32 it shouldn't exceed the sounds generated by traffic from motor vehicles. A professional go cart track with 15 go carts created a noise level up to 72 decibels at 150' ,which is less than a truck travelling at 50 mph. The site will have a storm water runoff plan and the storm water will be treated by a storm water planter. The well is 200' from all residents and it will be drilled, there will be no fracking. The septic will be approved by the D.O.H. and so will the well. The facility will be only be operating seasonally , there will be no dishwasher or any major use of water and therefore will not have a large water demand. There will only be 40 parking spaces and that would be for peak occupancy .The project site is over 1000' from any neighboring structures. The noise will be below the noise emanated from the state highway. The parking area will be gravel. The only impervious surfaces will be a small area for the mini golf and a place for parking the equipment and the go cart track. There will be a dumpster inside an enclosure and the rest of the garbage cans will be inside the concession stand

Mr. Federman stated there is a big push nationwide for electric go carts. In his research on the subject it is sited that the electric go carts have speed and torque, and are non- polluting with the exception of charging the batteries, and generate less noise.

Mr. Quimet responded electric go carts had been considered. He believes the concern for electric go carts is in regards to the down time for recharging, and the expense involved.

Mr. Matison asked if the go carts will be serviced on the site, and will there be gas on the site for refueling.

Mr. Quimet answered he will find that answered and get back to the Board .

Mr. Schwenzfeier stated the area to be used for storing gasoline and any petroleum, should be on the site plan.

Ms. Golden asked if the applicant could get back to the Board regarding the use of amplified music.

Mr. Hilscher stated he would like to see a cost analysis comparing the cost for 10 gasoline go carts, to the cost of 18 electric go carts.

Mr. DeLuca asked if the go karts could be fitted with additional mufflers for suppressing potential noise.

Mr. Quimet answered the go carts will have mufflers on them.

Mr. Schwenzfeier stated he would like to have the septic radius identified on the plans .

Ms. Golden stated the Greene Count Planning Board recommended plantings to help with the noise reduction.

Mr. Quimet responded there will be some plantings for the storm water plans, but the applicant wants some visibility for the attraction.

Ms. Golden stated she would like for the applicant to consider some type of plantings around the go carts track to help mitigate the concern with noise.

The Board reviewed recommendations from the Greene County Planning Board.

Mr. DeLuca made a motion to close the Public Hearing for SUP-2-2021, seconded by Ms. Bagshaw

Roll Call Vote

Mr. DeLuca	Aye
Mr. DiCaprio	Aye
Ms. VanDermark	Aye
Mr. Federman	Aye
Ms. Hernandez	Aye
Ms. Golden	Aye
Ms. Bagshaw	Aye Motion Approved.

Ms. Golden stated this project t can move forward once the questions brought up during the public hearing have been answered specifically, mitigation from noise , septic radius, gasoline storage, repair of equipment.

Ms. Golden thanked everyone for attending this public hearing .

Public Hearing Closed at 7:25 P.M.

OLD BUSINESS:

Special Use Permit SUP-4-2021 Dalina Gjergji 4 Forest Hill Road, Leeds.

Mr. Schwenzfeier real aloud part 2 of the EAF Mr.

Ms. Bagshaw made a motion to declare a negative declaration for SUP-4-2021, seconded by Ms. VanDermark.

Roll Call Vote

Mr. DeLuca	Aye
Mr. DiCaprio	Aye
Ms. VanDermark	Aye
Mr. Federman	Aye
,Ms. Hernandez	Aye
Ms. Golden	Aye
Ms. Bagshaw	Aye Motion Approved

Ms. Bagshaw made a motion to accept the application as complete, seconded by Mr. DiCaprio

Roll Call Vote

Mr. DeLuca	Aye
Mr. DiCaprio	Aye

Ms. VanDermark	Aye
Mr. Federman	Aye
,Ms. Hernandez	Aye
Ms. Golden	Aye
Ms. Bagshaw	Aye Motion Approved

Ms. VanDermark made a motion to accept the resolution approving SUP-4-2021, seconded by Mr. DeLuca

Roll Call Vote

Mr. DeLuca	Aye
Mr. DiCaprio	Aye
Ms. VanDermark	Aye
Mr. Federman	Aye
,Ms. Hernandez	Aye
Ms. Golden	Aye
Ms. Bagshaw	Aye Motion Approved.

Special Use Permit SUP-5-2021 Tom Banik Olympus Palace Road, Catskill.

Mr. Banik was present at tonight's meeting along with his surveyor Charles Holtz. This application was first before the Board on March 23, 2021 and on that date the Board declared lead agency on this project as an unlisted, uncoordinated review ,and accepted the plat as preliminary and scheduled a Public Hearing for April 27, 2021 . The Public Hearing was continued until the Planning Board May 11. 2021 meeting, at which time it was closed, but the applicant was asked to submit additional information regarding this project. The applicant submitted revised plans at this night's meeting indicting the location of propane tanks on the site, and proposed utility line, along with information on stack testing for the equipment to be used in the crematorium operation.

Mr. Federman stated the example for stack tests results from Dignified Services was very interesting and provided a lot of detail . Their test results showed 0.056 particulate matter which is just above the current regulations at 0.05 particulate matter. The air facility registration application was telling as far as what DEC requires in addition to the stack testing for measuring particulate matter. The project is applicable to sub part 2014, and required to register before operating. In addition to particulate matter it requires emission estimates for criterial pollutants, Carbon dioxide, large and small particulate matter , sulfur dioxide, nitrogen oxide, volatile organic compounds. The process will be required to provide the emissions information. However if all of the calculations used to determine that information is based on Incinerates, the information provided are only guidelines and may vary based on burn rate , waste pipe volume, moisture content ,and fuel use . He would request in addition to testing for particulate matter, that other substances be tested for as well. The EPA does not regulate this process only DEC who use the EPAs numbers.

Mr. Banik stated DEC regulates the use of the equipment, and holds strict guidelines to the testing of the process.

Mr. Holtz stated If DEC approves the process he does not see why there is any problem with this project going forward.

Discussion ensued regarding the facility emissions testing, and procedure for stack testing of equipment.

Mr. Federman stated in his research he found in other municipalities there are buffer distances from crematoriums and other residents. Where this equipment is manufactured in the UK, it is required that the equipment must be operated at least 200 yards away from residents, Australia requires 200 meters . At this

time this project site is less than 400' from a resident. He would suggest an alternative site for this project be considered. The Planning Board has the right to request alternative layouts for proposed projects.

The Board discussed the matter and all Board members support the relocation of the actual site, further from residents, would eliminate some of the concerns for this project regarding air quality.

Ms. Golden stated the Greene County Planning Board has recommended the Board request a full EAF. Also the project requires an Agricultural Statement.

Discussion ensued.

Mr. Banik stated he will consider relocating the placement of the containers.

Mr. Holtz stated he will submit the form for the Agricultural Statement.

Ms. Golden until the applicant submits a revised plan addressing the air emission concerns, the Board cannot move forward with this project.

OTHER BUSINESS:

Mr. Hilscher stated going forward he would recommend the Board require copies of land deeds for all applications.

Mr. DeLuca made motion for the Board to require copy of land deeds for all Planning Board subdivision, lot line adjustments, site plan reviews, and special use permit applications seconded by Mr. DiCaprio

Roll Call Vote

Mr. DeLuca	Aye
Mr. DiCaprio	Aye
Ms. VanDermark	Aye
Mr. Federman	Aye
Ms. Hernandez	Aye
Ms. Golden	Aye
Ms. Bagshaw	Aye Motion Approved.

Mr. Schwenzfeier stated the Town of Catskill should be receiving a grant for the updating of the comprehensive plan.

Ms. VanDermark made a motion to approve the meeting minutes for April 27, 2021 as amended, seconded by Mr. DeLuca.

Roll Call Vote

Mr. DeLuca	Aye
Mr. DiCaprio	Aye
Ms. VanDermark	Aye
Mr. Federman	Aye
Ms. Hernandez	Aye
Ms. Golden	Aye
Ms. Bagshaw	Aye Motion Approved.

Meeting minutes of May 11, 2021 were tabled.

Ms. Bagshaw made a motion to adjourn, seconded by Ms. VanDemark

Planning Board meeting ended at 8:16 PM

Respectfully Submitted,

Patricia Case-Keel
Planning Board Secretary

Approved as amended 7/13/2021

